# THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT DISTRICT OF NEW JERSEY CAMDEN DIVISION

Michael Whitekettle and Sherri Whitekettle,

Civil Action No.

Plaintiffs,

COMPLAINT

- against-

Discover Financial Services and TransUnion, LLC,

Defendants.

# **COMPLAINT**

Plaintiffs, Michael Whitekettle and Sherri Whitekettle (hereinafter "Plaintiffs"), by and through their attorneys, the Law Offices of Robert S. Gitmeid & Associates, PLLC, by way of Complaint against Defendants, Discover Financial Services ("Discover"), and TransUnion, LLC ("TransUnion") alleges as follows:

# **INTRODUCTION**

1. This is an action for damages brought by an individual consumer for Defendants' violations of the Fair Credit Reporting Act, 15 U.S.C. § 1681, et seq. (the "FCRA"), the New Jersey Fair Credit Reporting Act, N.J. Stat. §56:11-28, et seq. (the "NJ FCRA"), and other claims related to unlawful credit reporting practices. The FCRA and NJ FCRA prohibits furnishers and credit reporting agencies ("CRAs") from falsely and inaccurately reporting consumers' credit information.

## **PARTIES**

- 2. Plaintiffs, Michael Whitekettle and Sherri Whitekettle, are adult citizens of New Jersey, domiciled in Mount Ephraim, NJ.
- 3. Plaintiffs are "consumers" as defined by 15 U.S.C. § 1681a(c) of the FCRA.
- 4. Defendant Discover is a "furnisher" of consumer credit information as that term is used in Section 1681s-2 of the FCRA. Defendant Discover does business throughout the country and in the state of New Jersey.
- 5. Defendant TransUnion is a limited liability company, doing business throughout the country and in the state of New Jersey. TransUnion is a "consumer reporting agency" as defined in Section 1681a(f) of the FCRA. Trans Union is one of the largest CRAs in the world.

#### JURISDICTION AND VENUE

- 6. This Court has subject matter jurisdiction over this matter pursuant to 28 U.S.C. § 1331 because the rights and obligations of the parties in this action arise out of 15 U.S.C. § 1681 and 15 U.S.C. § 1681p, which provides that an action to enforce any liability created under 15 U.S.C. § 1681 may be brought in any appropriate United States District Court, without regard to the amount in controversy.
- 7. Venue is proper pursuant to 28 U.S.C. § 1391 (b)(2) because a substantial part of the events and omissions giving rise to Plaintiffs' claims occurred in New Jersey, where Plaintiffs reside.

# **FACTUAL ALLEGATIONS**

- 8. Defendant Discover issued an account ending in 44121691 to Plaintiffs. The account was routinely reported on Plaintiffs' consumer credit report.
- 9. The consumer report at issue is a written communication of information concerning Plaintiffs' credit worthiness, credit standing, credit capacity, character, general reputation, personal characteristics, or mode of living which is used or for the purpose of serving as a factor in establishing the consumer's eligibility for credit to be used primarily for personal, family, or household purposes as defined by 15 U.S.C. § 1681a(d)(1) of the FCRA.
- 10. On or about May 10, 2018, Plaintiffs and Discover, entered into a settlement agreement for the above referenced account. A redacted copy of the settlement agreement is attached hereto as **Exhibit A.**
- 11. Pursuant to the terms of the settlement, Plaintiffs made, and the creditor accepted monthly payments totaling \$1,772.00 to settle and close their Discover account.
- 12. Plaintiffs, via their debt settlement representative, timely made the requisite settlement payments. Redacted proofs of these payments are attached hereto as **Exhibit B.**
- 13. However, over half a year later, Plaintiffs' Discover account continued to be negatively reported.
- 14. In particular, on a requested credit report dated February 5, 2020, Plaintiffs' Discover account was reported with a status of "CHARGE OFF," a balance of

- \$1,771.00 and a past due balance \$1,771.00. The relevant portion of Plaintiffs' credit report is attached hereto as **Exhibit C.**
- 15. This tradeline was inaccurately reported. As evidenced by the enclosed documents, the account was settled for less than the full balance and must be reported as settled with a balance of \$0.00.
- 16. On or about March 13, 2020, Plaintiffs, via their attorney at the time, notified Defendants of a dispute with completeness and/or accuracy of the reporting of Plaintiffs' Discover account. A redacted copy of the dispute letter and certified mail receipts are attached hereto as **Exhibit D**.
- 17. Therefore, Plaintiffs disputed the accuracy of the derogatory information reported by Discover to credit reporting agencies via certified mail in accordance with 15 U.S.C. § 1681i of the FCRA.
- 18. In May of 2020, Plaintiffs requested updated credit reports for review. The tradeline for Plaintiffs' Discover account remained inaccurate, as Defendants failed to correct the inaccuracy. The relevant portion of the May 2020 credit report is attached hereto as **Exhibit E**.
- 19. Upon information and belief, TransUnion did not notify Discover of the dispute by Plaintiffs in accordance with the FCRA and NJ FCRA.
- 20. Alternatively, if TransUnion did notify Discover, Discover failed to properly investigate and delete the tradeline or properly update the tradeline on Plaintiffs' credit report.

- 21. If Discover had performed a reasonable investigation of Plaintiffs' dispute, Plaintiffs' Discover account would have been updated to reflect a "settled" status with a balance of \$0.00.
- 22. Despite the fact that Discover has promised through its subscriber agreements or contracts to accurately update accounts, Discover has nonetheless willfully, maliciously, recklessly, wantonly, and/or negligently failed to follow this requirement as well as the requirements set forth under the FCRA, which has resulted in the intended consequences of this information remaining on Plaintiffs' credit report.
- 23. Defendants failed to properly maintain and failed to follow reasonable procedures to assure maximum possible accuracy of Plaintiffs' credit information and Plaintiffs' credit reports, concerning the account in question, thus violating the FCRA and the NJ FCRA. These violations occurred before, during, and after the dispute process began with TransUnion.
- 24. At all times pertinent hereto, Defendants were acting by and through their agents, servants and/or employees, who were acting within the scope and course of their employment, and under the direct supervision and control of the Defendants herein.
- 25. At all times pertinent hereto, the conduct of Defendants, as well as that of their agents, servants and/or employees, was malicious, intentional, willful, reckless, negligent and in wanton disregard for federal law and the rights of the Plaintiffs herein.

# **FIRST CAUSE OF ACTION**

(Fair Credit Reporting Act)

- 26. Plaintiffs reassert and incorporate herein by reference all facts and allegations set forth above.
- 27. TransUnion is a "consumer reporting agency," as codified at 15 U.S.C. § 1681a(f).
- 28. Discover is an entity that, regularly and in the course of business, furnishes information to one or more consumer reporting agencies about its transactions or experiences with any consumer and therefore constitutes a "furnisher," as codified at 15 U.S.C. § 1681s-2.
- 29. Discover is reporting inaccurate credit information concerning Plaintiffs to one or more credit bureaus as defined by 15 U.S.C. § 1681a of the FCRA.
- 30. Plaintiffs notified Defendants of a dispute on the account's completeness and/or accuracy, as reported.
- 31. Discover failed to complete an investigation of Plaintiffs' written dispute and provide the results of an investigation to Plaintiffs and the credit bureaus within the 30-day statutory period as required by 15 U.S.C. § 1681s-2(b).
- 32. Discover failed to promptly correct the inaccurate information on Plaintiffs' credit reports in violation of 15 U.S.C. § 1681s-2(b).
- 33. TransUnion failed to delete information found to be inaccurate, reinserted the information without following the FCRA, or failed to properly investigate Plaintiffs' disputes.

- 34. TransUnion failed to maintain and failed to follow reasonable procedures to assure maximum possible accuracy of Plaintiffs' credit reports, concerning the account in question, violating 15 U.S.C. § 1681e(b).
- 35. As a result of the above violations of the FCRA, Plaintiffs suffered actual damages in one or more of the following categories: lower credit score, denial of credit, embarrassment and emotional distress caused by the inability to obtain financing for everyday expenses, rejection of credit card application, higher interest rates on loan offers that would otherwise be affordable and other damages that may be ascertained at a later date.
- 36. As a result of the above violations of the FCRA, Defendants are liable to Plaintiffs for actual damages, punitive damages, statutory damages, attorney's fees and costs.

#### **SECOND CAUSE OF ACTION**

(New Jersey Fair Credit Reporting Act)

- 37. Plaintiffs reassert and incorporate herein by reference all facts and allegations set forth above.
- 38. TransUnion failed to delete information found to be inaccurate, reinserted the information without following the NJ FCRA, or failed to properly investigate Plaintiffs' disputes.
- 39. TransUnion failed to complete an investigation of Plaintiffs' written dispute and provide the results of an investigation to Plaintiffs within the 30-day statutory period as required by NJ FCRA, N.J. Stat. §C.56:11-36f(1).
- 40. TransUnion failed to delete information found to be inaccurate, reinserted the information without following the NJ FCRA, or failed to properly investigate

- Plaintiffs' disputes as required by NJ FCRA, N.J. Stat. §C.56:11-36(a) and N.J. Stat. §C.56:11-36 (e).
- 41. As a result of the above violations of the NJ FCRA, Plaintiffs suffered actual damages in one or more of the following categories: lower credit score and credit rating, denial of credit, embarrassment and emotional distress caused by the inability to obtain financing for everyday expenses, rejection of credit card application, higher interest rates on loan offers that would otherwise be affordable and other damages that may be ascertained at a later date.
- 42. As a result of the above violations of the NJ FCRA, Defendants are liable to Plaintiffs for actual damages, punitive damages, statutory damages, attorney's fees and costs.

**WHEREFORE**, Plaintiffs demands that judgment be entered against Defendants as follows:

- 1. That judgment be entered against Defendants for actual damages pursuant to 15 U.S.C. § 1681n or alternatively, 15 U.S.C. § 1681o;
- 2. That judgment be entered against Defendants for punitive damages pursuant to 15 U.S.C. § 1681n;
- 3. That the Court award costs and reasonable attorney's fees pursuant to 15 U.S.C. § 1681n or alternatively, 15 U.S.C. § 1681o;
- 4. That judgment be entered against Defendants for actual damages pursuant to N.J. Stat. §C.56:11-38 or alternatively, N.J. Stat. §C.56:11-39;
- 5. That judgment be entered against Defendants for punitive damages pursuant to N.J. Stat. §C.56:11-38;
- 6. That the Court award costs and reasonable attorney's fees pursuant to N.J. Stat. §C.56:11-38 or alternatively, N.J. Stat. §C.56:11-39; and
- 7. That the Court grant such other and further relief as may be just and proper.

## **DEMAND FOR JURY TRIAL**

Pursuant to Rule 38 of the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure, Plaintiffs demands trial by jury in this action of all issues so triable.

Respectfully Submitted,

Law Offices of Robert S. Gitmeid & Associates, PLLC

/s/ Maksim Reznik Maksim Reznik, Esq. 30 Wall Street, 8th Floor #741 New York, NY 10005 Tel: (866) 249-1137

Fax: (877) 366-4747

Email: Maksim.R@Gitmeidlaw.com

Counsel for Plaintiffs

# $_{\rm JS~44~(Rev.~06/17)}$ Case 1:20-cv-06164-JHR-JSC Pocument 1. Filed 05/20/20 Page 10 of 10 PageID: 10

The JS 44 civil cover sheet and the information contained herein neither replace nor supplement the filing and service of pleadings or other papers as required by law, except as provided by local rules of court. This form, approved by the Judicial Conference of the United States in September 1974, is required for the use of the Clerk of Court for the purpose of initiating the civil docket sheet. (SEE INSTRUCTIONS ON NEXT PAGE OF THIS FORM.)

I. (a) PLAINTIFFS	valor shooti (b22 morne e		DEFENDANTS		
(b) County of Residence of First Listed Plaintiff (EXCEPT IN U.S. PLAINTIFF CASES)  (c) Attorneys (Firm Name, Address, and Telephone Number)			County of Residence of First Listed Defendant  (IN U.S. PLAINTIFF CASES ONLY)  NOTE: IN LAND CONDEMNATION CASES, USE THE LOCATION OF THE TRACT OF LAND INVOLVED.  Attorneys (If Known)		
II. BASIS OF JURISDI	CTION (Place an "X" in O	ne Box Only)	 III. CITIZENSHIP OF P	RINCIPAL PARTIES	(Place an "X" in One Box for Plaintiff
☐ 1 U.S. Government Plaintiff	☐ 3 Federal Question (U.S. Government in	Not a Party)		TF DEF  1 □ 1 Incorporated or Pr  of Business In 1	
☐ 2 U.S. Government Defendant	☐ 4 Diversity (Indicate Citizenship of Parties in Item III)		Citizen of Another State	2	
			Citizen or Subject of a Foreign Country	3 🗖 3 Foreign Nation	□ 6 □ 6
IV. NATURE OF SUIT (Place an "X" in One Box Only)			Click here for: Nature of Suit Code Descriptions.		
CONTRACT		DEDSONAL INTUDY	FORFEITURE/PENALTY  7 625 Drug Releted Seigure	BANKRUPTCY	OTHER STATUTES
□ 110 Insurance □ 120 Marine □ 130 Miller Act □ 140 Negotiable Instrument □ 150 Recovery of Overpayment	PERSONAL INJURY  □ 310 Airplane □ 315 Airplane Product Liability □ 320 Assault, Libel & Slander □ 330 Federal Employers' Liability □ 340 Marine □ 345 Marine Product Liability □ 350 Motor Vehicle □ 355 Motor Vehicle Product Liability □ 360 Other Personal Injury □ 362 Personal Injury - Medical Malpractice  CIVIL RIGHTS □ 440 Other Civil Rights □ 441 Voting □ 442 Employment □ 443 Housing/ Accommodations □ 445 Amer. w/Disabilities - Employment □ 446 Amer. w/Disabilities - Other	PERSONAL INJURY  □ 365 Personal Injury - Product Liability  □ 367 Health Care/ Pharmaceutical Personal Injury Product Liability  □ 368 Asbestos Personal Injury Product Liability  PERSONAL PROPER: □ 370 Other Fraud □ 371 Truth in Lending □ 380 Other Personal Property Damage Product Liability  PRISONER PETITION  Habeas Corpus: □ 463 Alien Detainee □ 510 Motions to Vacate Sentence □ 530 General □ 535 Death Penalty Other: □ 540 Mandamus & Othe □ 550 Civil Rights	of Property 21 USC 881    690 Other	□ 422 Appeal 28 USC 158 □ 423 Withdrawal 28 USC 157  PROPERTY RIGHTS □ 820 Copyrights □ 830 Patent □ 835 Patent - Abbreviated New Drug Application □ 840 Trademark SOCIAL SECURITY □ 861 HIA (1395ff) □ 862 Black Lung (923) □ 863 DIWC/DIWW (405(g)) □ 864 SSID Title XVI □ 865 RSI (405(g))  FEDERAL TAX SUITS □ 870 Taxes (U.S. Plaintiff or Defendant) □ 871 IRS—Third Party 26 USC 7609	□ 375 False Claims Act □ 376 Qui Tam (31 USC 3729(a)) □ 400 State Reapportionment □ 410 Antitrust □ 430 Banks and Banking □ 450 Commerce □ 460 Deportation □ 470 Racketeer Influenced and Corrupt Organizations □ 480 Consumer Credit □ 490 Cable/Sat TV □ 850 Securities/Commodities/ Exchange □ 890 Other Statutory Actions □ 891 Agricultural Acts □ 893 Environmental Matters □ 895 Freedom of Information Act □ 896 Arbitration □ 899 Administrative Procedure Act/Review or Appeal of Agency Decision □ 950 Constitutionality of State Statutes
V. ODJON	☐ 448 Education	☐ 555 Prison Condition ☐ 560 Civil Detainee - Conditions of Confinement	Actions		
		Remanded from Appellate Court	1 4 Reinstated or Reopened 5 Transfe Anothe	r District Litigation	
VI. CAUSE OF ACTIO			e filing (Do not cite jurisdictional stat	utes unless diversity):	
VII. REQUESTED IN COMPLAINT: CHECK IF THIS IS A CLASS ACTION UNDER RULE 23, F.R.Cv.P.			DEMAND \$	CHECK YES only if demanded in complaint:  JURY DEMAND:	
VIII. RELATED CASE IF ANY	(See instructions):	JUDGE		DOCKET NUMBER	
DATE		SIGNATURE OF ATT	ORNEY OF RECORD		
FOR OFFICE USE ONLY					
	10UNT	APPLYING IFP	JUDGE	MAG. JUI	DGE